Biological Integrity of Key Species and Habitats

October 6, 2022

Biological Integrity of Key Species and Habitats

Agenda

r
it can be learned from managing
en problems in the Baltic Sea?
cies and food web responses to
dissolved oxygen in the Salish Sea
ak
Ą
ogical impacts of low oxygen
ls on Puget Sound species
ussion
p-up

Navigating the Workshop

Welcome! While we wait, please:

- Update your name to include your pronouns and organization
- Message Marielle with any access needs
- Introduce yourself in the chat. We've muted participants and turned off your videos to minimize technical issues, so we encourage you to use the chat to say hello instead

Questions or Comments?

- Add them to the chat
- Raise your hand and we'll unmute you



The slides, recording, and summary will be available on **Puget Sound Institute's website**

Land Acknowledgement

University of Washington Puget Sound Institute's Role

Puget Sound Partnerships' Marine Water Quality Implementation Strategy



Research, Modeling, and Monitoring to Reduce Uncertainties

Nutrient Science Community in Puget Sound

PUGET SOUND INSTITUTE

- ALISH SEA MODELING CENTER UNIVERSITY of WASHINGTO
- Help address technical uncertainties and advance modeling tools to assist decision-making.
- Facilitate scientific workshops and regional collaboration
- Convene Model Evaluation Group
- Lead complementary model runs
- Expand access to models, outputs, tools, and scientific knowledge

Targeted Technical Uncertainties

- Improve confidence in modeling of the Salish Sea and share findings
- Kickoff (7/26)
- Tools to Evaluate Water Quality (9/29)
- Biological integrity of key habitats and species (10/6)

Upcoming Workshops

- Sediment exchange (10/17)
- Phytoplankton and primary production (11/2)
- Change in interannual variability of rivers and ocean impact (week of 11/14)
- Improve watershed modeling to evaluate source reduction strategies to adaptively manage strategies (week of 12/12)

Improved Confidence in Actions

Technical Uncertainties

Refine Research Actions

Driving Scientific Question

How do we evaluate water quality with the tools that we have relative to the needs of key species, food webs, and habitats?

Build common knowledge around the science to inform a range of recovery efforts



6 October 2022

WHAT CAN BE LEARNED FROM MANAGING OXYGEN PROBLEMS IN THE BALTIC SEA?

Jacob Carstensen, Aarhus University







Dept of ECOSCIENCE

If you can't breathe, nothing else matters





6 October 2022

6 October 2022



Hypoxia is a growing global problem



Breitburg et al., 2018, Science





Well-studied areas: Gulf of Mexico

- Receives excess nutrients from the Mississippi River watershed, stimulating production and creates stratified conditions along the coastal margin
- > On average 14000 km² affected by hypoxia (<2 mg/L)
 - 0.6%
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0
 0.0



> June-August

Pitcher et al. (2021) Prog.Oceanogr.



Well-studied areas: Chesapeake Bay

- The largest estuary in the US
- Receives freshwater
 from several large
 rivers, although
 Susquehanna is the
 dominant (>80%)
- Seasonal hypoxia of about 10 km³ (volume!)









>

Well-studied areas: Changjiang and Zhujiang estuaries





Changjiang Estuary: Seasonal hypoxiatypically August for (around 10-15.000 km²) at depths of 20-50 m **Zhujiang Estuary:** Seasonal hypoxia (~1000 km²) in wet season (lower part) at depths of 10-30 m and dry season

(upper part)



Well-studied areas: Black Sea

- Natural hypoxia due to the restricted ventilation of bottom waters
- Waters are sulfidic from about 100 m and below
- The Black Sea was a lake until ca. 8000 years ago
- The northwestern shelf has also experienced seasonal hypoxia

Pitcher et al. (2021) Prog.Oceanogr.



University of Washington workshop



6 October 2022

6 October 2022

Outline of talk

- Different types of how hypoxia manifests itself in different Baltic systems and the mechanisms behind
 - > Central open basin (perennial)
 - > Entrance area/Danish Straits (seasonal)
 - > Coastal areas (episodic)
- > Future trajectories of hypoxia in response to management and climate change
 - > Current policy frameworks
 - > The multiple synergistic and negative effects of warming
- > Consequences of hypoxia
 - > Fauna
 - > Biogeochemical cycles

THE BALTIC SEA



A century expansion of perennial hypoxia in the Baltic Sea



20°E

65°N

Seasonal hypoxia in the western Baltic Sea



Widespread coastal hypoxia



Baltic Sea hypoxia takes many shapes and sizes

Stagnation period

Perennial hypoxia

(a) 80

60

Open central Baltic Sea

Hypoxic area (10³ km²) 40 20 0 1970 1990 2010 1890 1910 1930 1950 (b) 14 -2014 12 -2015 Oxygen conc. (mg L⁻¹) -2016 -2017 -2018 2 Danish Straits 60 90 120 150 180 210 240 270 300 330 360 (C) 12 Oxygen conc. (mg L⁻¹) 8 - Mixed Stratified 2 Limfjorden (2008) 120 150 180 210 240 270 300 330 360 60 90 Julian day



Episodic hypox

Carstensen & Conley (2019) L&O Bulletin

WHY IS HYPOXIA SUCH A BIG PROBLEM IN THE BALTICSEA?

MECHANISMS GOVERNING THE OXYGEN SUPPLY







The ventilation of the bottom waters is driven by events of saltwater intrusions of variable density and mixing across the halocline



Saltwater intrusions happen at variable frequency and intensity



Recent expansion of perennial hypoxia in the Baltic Sea



Updated from Carstensen et al. (2014) PNAS

Recent expansion of perennial hypoxia in the Baltic Sea



Updated from Carstensen et al. (2014) PNAS



Oxygen supply decreases with temperature





MECHANISMS GOVERNING THE OXYGEN CONSUMPTION





Nutrient enrichment of the Baltic Sea



Particle shuttling contributes to oxygen demand in the deep basins



sediment age and increasing sedimentary inventories of POC and chlorophyll *a* with normalised water depth. Our calculations indicate that particle shuttling redistributes almost half of the deposited export production from ET areas to A areas in the Baltic Proper, and that substantial amounts of terrestrial organic material are transported

Source: Nielsson et al. (2021) MarChem

15°E

65°N-

20°E

Gulf Bothnia 25°E

GOB

Bothnian Bay

GOB2

30°E

Depth (m)

20

120

160

200

250

300

> 400

OXV1 Gulf of Finland

Temperature enhances respiration



Stagnation period

Updated from Carstensen et al. (2014) PNAS

SEASONAL HYPOXIA IN THE WESTERN BALTIC SEA



Imbalance between oxygen supply and consumption on a seasonal scale





Source: Hansen et al. (2016) DCE report

Imbalance between oxygen supply and consumption on a seasonal scale



EPISODIC HYPOXIA


Imported hypoxia from deeper waters



Low resilience from thin bottom layer and high oxygen demand

































HYPOXIA IN THE FUTURE



DIFFERENT POLICIES APPLY TO DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE BALTIC SEA



BALTIC SEA ACTION PLAN (2021)

Eutrophication goal

"Baltic Sea unaffected by eutrophication"



SDG targets addressed

- 2.4 By 2030, ensure sustainable food production systems and implement resilient agricultural practices that increase productivity and production, that help maintain ecosystems, that strengthen capacity for adaptation to climate change, extreme weather, drought, flooding and other disasters and that progressively improve land and soil quality.
 6.3 By 2030, improve water quality by
- 6.3 By 2030, improve water quality by reducing pollution, eliminating dumping and minimizing release of hazardous chemicals and materials, halving the proportion of untreated wastewater and substantially increasing recycling and safe reuse globally
- 6.5 By 2030, implement integrated water resources management at all levels, including through transboundary cooperation as appropriate
- 14.1 By 2025, prevent and significantly reduce marine pollution of all kinds, in particular from land-based activities, including marine debris and nutrient pollution

Further information on connection to other treaties related to eutrophication can be found on page 26.



- Reaching the objectives for eutrophication is a necessity to meet the goal 'Baltic Sea ecosystem is healthy and resilient';
- Reaching the goal and objectives for seabased activities is a requirement for reaching the goal for eutrophication.

Table 2a. Net nutrient input ceilings (NIC) of nitrogen for the HELCOM countries, non-HELCOM countries in the Baltic Sea catchment area, other countries with airborne input, Baltic Sea shipping and North Sea shipping (in tonnes/year).

	Bothnian Bay	Bothnian Sea	Baltic Proper	Gulf of Finland	Gulf of Riga	Danish Straits	Kattegat
Germany	947	3,920	34,077	1,645	1,747	23,647	4,661
Denmark	280	1,148	9,025	421	462	28,067	28,538
Estonia	113	404	1,478	11,334	13,099	22	24
Finland	35,087	28,700	1,827	20,457	295	76	89
Lithuania	108	495	25,878	305	8,820	66	80
Latvia	73	330	6,457	246	43,074	31	34
Poland	668	3,125	151,997	1,407	1,596	1,480	1,443
Russia	839	1,993	10,317	61,503	3,296	238	245
Sweden	17,718	32,633	30,690	626	525	6,056	32,799
Other countries with airborne input	1,375	5,008	26,947	2,986	2,188	4,933	4,502
Belarus	-	-	13,456	-	12,820	-	-
Czech Republic	-	-	3,551	-	-	-	-
Ukraine	-	-	1,693	-	-	-	-
Baltic Sea shipping	284	1,141	5,180	675	345	651	701
North Sea shipping	131	475	2,427	196	150	729	884

https://helcom.fi/baltic-sea-action-plan/

Outlook for the Baltic Sea

No quick recovery from hypoxia

C/I BREATHING LIFE INTO THE BALTIC SOURCE: REF. Models predict that the action plan to reduce nutrients that flow into the Baltic Sea should be effective at increasing oxygen levels in the water. - Reference (nutrient 🛑 Business as usual Baltic Sea Action Plan (nutrient input decreases) (nutrient input increases) input remains constant) 100.Hypoxic area (thousands of square kilometres) 2007: Baltic Sea Action Plan adopted 2021: Deadline for achieving 'good ecological status' Scenarios incorporate warming effects 0 -2000 2100 1960 1980 2020 2040 2060 2080

Sources: Meier et al. (2011) GRL and Conley (2012) Nature

Outlook for the Danish Straits

A 4 °C temperature will double the hypoxic area



Source: Conley et al. (2009) Hydrobiol

Effect of management

What if nutrient inputs had not been reduced?



Source: Andersen & Carstensen (2011) Politiken

SUMMARY: DRIVERS OF HYPOXIA

- The Baltic Sea is naturally prone to hypoxia due to its restricted exchange with the oceans
 - Modern hypoxia in the Baltic Sea is driven by increased nutrient input and is more intense and widespread than observed in the geological past
 - Saltwater inflows modulate hypoxia in the Baltic Sea giving a short-term relief, but enhances stratification and hypoxia in the long term
 - Seasonal hypoxia will become more frequent and hypoxia will expand in a warmer climate without nutrient reductions

WHAT ARE THE CONSEQUENCES OF HYPOXIA3



Oxygen affects everything



Biodiversity Food webs

Biogeochemistry Feedback to climate system & further deoxygenation Evolution/ Adaptation

Habitat degradation Tropics – poles Physiological – Population level effects Fisheries Economies Human health





Effect on benthic fauna and their bioengineering



Pearson & Rosenberg (1978)

Meadows & Tait (1989)



Deoxygenation increases energy flow to microbes



University of Washington workshop

6 October 2022



The entire benthic community changes

Turnover time

Turnover time



Biological Traits important for carbon and nutrient turnover and retention

- large
- long-lived
- slow-growing
- perennials
- deep-dwelling bioturbators
- high energy and CNP content per individual

- small
- short-lived
- annuals
- fast-growing
- surface-modifiers
- low energy and CNP content per individual

Carstensen et al. (2020) AMBIO Dept of ECOSCIENCE

6 October 2022

Assessing the loss of benthic fauna – catastrophic year



Estimated 300000 tons of benthic biomass was lost by comparing before and after situation

This corresponds roughly to the weight of the Danish population

Hansen et al. (2003)



Assessing the loss of benthic fauna – Baltic Sea



Estimated 3 mio. tons of benthic biomass is missing due to hypoxia

Karlson et al. (2002)



University of Washington workshop

6 October 2022

... and occasionally fish get caught in hypoxic waters





Cod reproductive volume in the Baltic Sea



Dept of ECOSCIENCE

AARHUS UNIVERSITY









Hypoxia reduces sediment denitrification and creates N feedback





Source: Jeremy Testa

Hypoxia enhances P release from sediments



The "vicious" circle



Source: Vahtera et al. (2007) Ambio
SUMMARY: CONSEQUENCES OF HYPOXIA

Hypoxia alters the biogeochemical cycling of nutrients (redoxdependent processes), enhancing recycling of N and P that sustain eutrophication

Non-motile benthic species are naturally more tolerant to low oxygen concentrations

... but also more susceptible to extended periods of hypoxia, which alters the composition by loosing perennial engineering species first

Fish are affected through habitat losses (benthic and pelagic), making them more vulnerable to predation (including fishing) Warming enhances the effects of hypoxia and therefore nutrient reductions will be even more critical in the future

TAKE HOME MESSAGES FOR PUGET SOUND

 The terminal inlets are naturally prone to low oxygen conditions due to the relelatively shallow thickness of the bottom layer and reduced ventilation (seasonally) – similar to the mechanisms some areas of the Danish Straits

The supply of oxygen is primarily governed by the physics, but the risk of oxygen demand outpacing oxygen supply increases with eutrophication (enhanced supply of OM to the bottom)

Efforts to improve oxygen conditions can be counteracted by climate change, e.g. from oxygen-poorer waters entering PS, but this does not means that these efforts have been in wain

Species and Food Web Responses to low dissolved oxygen in the Salish Sea

Tim Essington

University of Washington

School of Aquatic and Fishery Sciences

Collaborators

- Sean Anderson
- Lewis Barnett
- Anne Beaudreau
- Halle Berger
- Halley Froehlich
- John Horne
- Emma Hodgson
- Shannon Hennessey
- Phil Levin
- Lingbo Li

- Julie Keister
- P. Sean McDonald
- Pamela Moriarty
- Jan Newton
- Caroline Paulsen
- Sandy Parker-Stetter
- Samantha Sleidlecki
- Mei Sato
- Eric Ward

Main take home points

- Organisms have behavioral and physiological coping mechanisms that vary across taxa
- Indirect effects stemming from coping mechanisms are likely but hard to predict
- We have core biological knowledge to understand the types of organismal responses in a risk-based framework

Gas physiology 101



Coping with low dissolved oxygen?



Coping with low dissolved oxygen?



Coping with low dissolved oxygen?



Responses to seasonal hypoxia: acute vs. chronic effects

Intensity of Seasonal Hypoxia: South Hood Canal



Data from HCDOP Citizens Monitoring Program



BACI – Type Design

1 Impact site "Hoodsport"
3 Reference sites

Account for basin or other
effects related to bathymetic
profiles











General Results



Oxygen high everywhere

Oxygen low at Hoodsport

Main Findings





Absent all of the Time

Absent during low dissolved oxygen events

What about nearshore habitats?





Gas physiology 101



An Aside on Geoducks

Geoducks are rare at all depths in southern region

Cannot be explained by substrate availability



Unexpected Food Web Effects to low Dissolved Oxygen

Consequences of Distributional Shifts?



Moderate Tolerance



High tolerance

Consequences of Distributional Shifts?



Dissolved oxygen

Consequences of Distributional Shifts?



Depth

Dissolved oxygen

Sampling Design



Seasonal dynamics of O₂ by Site

2012 0 40 08 (m) 120 -× × × 53 3 160 2 Site B Site C Site D Site A 200 Sept Sept Oct June Sept Oct Oct Oct Aug Aug Aug Sept June July Aug June July July June July Month



Expectations

- Lower predator-prey overlap
- Reduced feeding rate on zooplankton

Depth

- Increased zooplankton density
- Reduced predator density



Reality

- Lower predator-prey overlap NOPE
- Reduced feeding rate on zooplankton A LITTLE
- Increased zooplankton density NOPE, the OPPOSITE
- Reduced predator density NOPE, THE OPPOSITE

Herring were exposed to [O₂] that were lethal in lab studies, and expressed Hypoxia Inducible Factor



Estimating species tolerances and forecasting

Moving forward: predicting effects in a changing climate

- Metabolic index: ratio of metabolic supply vs. demand
 - Incorporates joint effects of temperature and oxygen
- Estimating these in the lab



Sablefish Distributions in the California Current

Can we identify oxygen thresholds?

Does metabolic index improve predictions?



Yes! Threshold effects are estimated!



No! Metabolic Index gets confused



Ongoing Activities

- Can we predict oxygen sensitivities via metabolic index when lab experiments are lacking?
 - Hierarchical modeling approach
 - Nope
 - Species Distribution Approach
 - Working on it

Moving forward in Puget Sound: A focus on Risk

Vulnerability Analysis

- <u>Exposure</u> overlap between area of "bad" oxygen level (or metabolic index) and species (by life stage)
- <u>Consequence</u> at species level
 - Mortality
 - Development
 - Growth

Vulnerability Assessment: Dungeness Crab in the California Current



Pay attention to Dungeness Crab
Focus on Thresholds and Risk



Thank you to funders

- National Science Foundation
- Washington Sea Grant
- Hood Canal Dissolved Oxygen Program
- NOAA Fisheries

Questions for the Region

6PPF nate Toxic Emerg

Multiple-Stressors + Multiple Benefits • How do we build on the current focus on dissolved oxygen and nutrients to include multiple stressors?

 How do we balance a species, key indicator, and ecosystem approach across different efforts?

 How do we incorporate ideas of adaptation and resilience in the face of climate change?

Questions?

Tessa Francis

Tessa Francis

UW Puget Sound Institute

Biological impacts of low oxygen levels on Puget Sound species

Biological impacts of low oxygen levels to Puget Sound species

Objective:

 Describe potential risk to Puget Sound species (mostly fish) of low oxygen levels in marine waters, using existing modeling output and literature sources.



A risk assessment framework

Risk =

Exposure + Species distribution Oxygen patterns Sensitivity Physiological effects

Species distribution Atlantis Ecosystem Model





Exposure - I

Courtesy of Hem Nalini Morzaria-Luna

Exposure - II

Oxygen patterns
Salish Sea Model





<u>Ahmed et al. (2019)</u>

2006 maximum dissolved oxygen depletions below the water quality standard due to all anthropogenic sources

Sensitivity





Sensitivity

Behavior

- Lethal vs sublethal effects
- Life stage





Contents lists available at SciVerse ScienceDirect

Biological Conservation

BIOLOGICAI

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/biocon

Linking land- and sea-based activities to risk in coastal ecosystems

Jameal F. Samhouri^{*}, Phillip S. Levin Conservation Biology Division, Northwest Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, 2725 Montlake Blvd, E. Seattle, WA 98112, USA

Qualitative criteria

- Spatial overlap
- **Temporal overlap**
- Exploitation
- Etc. •





Quantitative data





Other criteria?

Contents lists available at SciVerse ScienceDirect

Biological Conservation

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/biocon

BIOLOGICA Conserva

Linking land- and sea-based activities to risk in coastal ecosystems

Jameal F. Samhouri^{*}, Phillip S. Levin

Conservation Biology Division, Northwest Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, 2725 Montlake Blvd, E. Seattle, WA 98112, USA

Qualitative criteria

- Severity of impact
 - Population
 - Individual •
- Current status ۲
- Intrinsic recovery factors
 - Replenishment rate •
 - Connectivity

	1	2	3
Severity of impact (pop.)	<10%	10-50%	>50%
	loss	loss	loss

Other criteria?



Sensitivity



Biological Conservation



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/biocon

Linking land- and sea-based activities to risk in coastal ecosystems

Jameal F. Samhouri*, Phillip S. Levin

ELSEVIER

Conservation Biology Division, Northwest Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, 2725 Montlake Blvd. E, Seattle, WA 98112, USA





 Use an understanding of risk to prioritize action





Take a multi-stressor approach

Thank you!

tessa@uw.edu



Wrap up

- We'll share the presentation materials, recording, and a summary of the discussion
- Subscribe for updates at <u>http://eepurl.com/h5nxsr</u>
- Share any people, programs, or studies we should connect with
- Continue the discussion
 - Email Stefano Mazzilli (<u>mazzilli@uw.edu</u>) and Marielle Larson (<u>marlars@uw.edu</u>) to connect directly
 - Join the upcoming workshops to dig in further

Upcoming Workshops

Sediment exchange (10/17)

Phytoplankton and primary production (11/2)

Change in interannual variability of rivers and ocean impact (week of 11/14)

Improve watershed modeling to evaluate source reduction strategies to adaptively manage strategies (week of 12/12)

Appendix

Supporting Line of Evidence: Metabolic Index

Acidification **Oxygen Loss Aragonite Saturation State** Metabolic Index Healthy populations supported $\Omega = 1.4$ $\Phi_{ ext{CRIT (species-specific value)}}$ Sublethal, organismal fitness effects documented $\Omega = 1.0$ $\Phi = 1$ Lethal effects, reproductive effects % Change in Habitat Thickness Habitat Oct-1999 35°N · Expansion 30 20 34°N 10 0 33°N --10 -20 Habitat 32°N -30 Compression 121°W 120°W 119°W 118°W 117°W Presentation by Martha Sutula at The Science of Puget Sound Water Quality workshop on July 26, 2022

Combines pO₂ with temperature-dependent biological responses to oxygen in order to define "aerobically available habitat"

Modeling Capacity and Interpretation

Streamlined analyses to existing parameters (e.g., dissolved oxygen, temperature, net primary production rates, etc.):

- Across time, depth, and location, including:
 - Annually, seasonally, or daily
 - By basin and embayment
- From a range of perspectives (e.g., absolute values, noncompliance days, % volume days, etc.
- Under scenarios with different loading inputs at each wastewater treatment plant and river



2014 Conditions (Whidbey Region) Min Daily Dissolved Oxygen (DO) January 07, 2014

DOXG [mg/l]

0 - 2

3 - 4

4 - 5

Supporting Line of Evidence: DO Variability

Annually, seasonally or daily:

- Minimum dissolved oxygen
- Dissolved oxygen variability
- Rate of dissolved oxygen change
- Number of hypoxia exposures
- Hypoxia exposure duration (hours)
- Hypoxia return time (hours)

e.g., Low et al. (2021)

